MA2020-6

MARINE ACCIDENT INVESTIGATION REPORT

July 30, 2020



The objective of the investigation conducted by the Japan Transport Safety Board in accordance with the Act for Establishment of the Japan Transport Safety Board is to determine the causes of an accident and damage incidental to such an accident, thereby preventing future accidents and reducing damage. It is not the purpose of the investigation to apportion blame or liability.

TAKEDA Nobuo Chairman Japan Transport Safety Board

Note:

This report is a translation of the Japanese original investigation report. The text in Japanese shall prevail in the interpretation of the report.

MARINE ACCIDENT INVESTIGATION REPORT

July 1, 2020

Adopted by the Japan Transport Safety Board				
Chairman	TAKEDA Nobuo			
Member	SATO Yuji			
Member	TAMURA Kenkichi			
Member	KAKISHIMA Yoshiko			
Member	OKAMOTO Makiko			

Date and time			
	Around 4:22 on September 2, 2019 (local time, UTC+9 hours)		
Location	Akashi Kaikyo Traffic Route		
	Around 019° true bearing, 1.3 nautical miles (M) from Esaki		
	Lighthouse		
	(approximately 34°37.6'N, 135°00.0'E)		
Summary of the Accident	The car carrier GLOVIS COMPANION was proceeding west in the		
	Akashi-Kaikyo Traffic Route and the fishing vessel HIGASHIDA		
	MARU was proceeding southeast and attempting to cross the		
	Akashi-Kaikyo Traffic Route when both vessels collided in the		
	Akashi-Kaikyo Traffic Route.		
	The master of HIGASHIDA MARU was injured, and her bow		
	sustained crushing and other damage, while GLOVIS COMPANION		
	sustained abrasions on her starboard- side shell plating.		
Process and Progress of	(1) Set up of the Investigation		
the Investigation	The Japan Transport Safety Board (hereinafter referred to as		
	"JTSB") appointed an investigator-in-charge and two other		
	marine accident investigators to investigate this accident on		
	September 2, 2019.		
	(2) Collection of Evidence		
	September 3 to 5, December 9 and 10, 2019: On-site		
	investigations and Interviews October 7, and 16, 2019: Collection of questionnaires		
	March 16, 2020: Interviews (3) Comments from Parties Relevant to the Cause		
	Comments on the draft report were invited from parties relevant		
	to the cause of accident.		
	(4) Comments from the Flag State		
	Comments on the draft report were invited from the Flag State		
	of GLOVIS COMPANION.		

Factual Information	Vessel A		
Vessel type and name	Car carrier GLOVIS COMPANION (Republic of the Marshall		
Gross tonnage	Islands registry), 60,213 tons		
Vessel number	9460899 (IMO number)		
Owner	NOCC SHIPOWNING AS (Owner)		
Management Company	WALLEM SHIPMANAGEMENT LTD (Management company)		
Class	NK		
L×B×D, Hull material	199.99 m x 32.26 m x 34.52 m, Steel		
Engine, Output	Diesel engine, 14,315 kW		
Date of launch, etc.	December 10, 2008 (laid keel)		
	Vessel B		
	Fishing vessel HIGASHIDA MARU		
	3.7 tons		
	HG3-26769 (fishing vessel registration number), private owner		
	10.97 m x 2.79 m x 0.94 m, Fiber Reinforced Plastic		
	Diesel engine, 51 kW		
	April 30, 1999		
	No. 260-39770 (Ship Inspection. Completion Slip. Number)		
Crew Information	Vessel A		
	Pilot A, male, 73 years old		
	1st Grade Inlandsea Pilot Certificate		
	Date of issue: February 18, 2002		
	Date of revalidation: January 22, 2018		
	Date of expiry: February 17, 2021		
	Master A (Nationality: India), male, 57 years old		
	Endorsement attesting the recognition of certificate		
	Certificate of Master (issued by the Republic of the Marshall		
	Islands)		
	Date of issue: March 30, 2016)		
	(valid until March 23, 2021)		
	Navigation Officer A (Nationality: Democratic Socialist		
	Republic of Sri Lanka), male, 34 years old		
	Endorsement attesting the recognition of certificate		
	Certificate of Master (issued by the Republic of the Marshall		
	Islands)		
	Date of issue: November 16, 2016		
	(valid until June 19, 2021)		
	Vessel B		
	Master B, male, 78 years old		
	First class boat's operator, personal watercraft operator,		
	with passenger service license		
	Date of issue: October 21, 1975		
	Date of revalidation: August 11, 2014 (valid until July 7, 2020)		
Injunios to Dongong	(valid until July 7, 2020)		
Injuries to Persons	Vessel A: None		

	Vessel B: Minor injuries to one person (Master B)			
Damage to Vessel	Vessel A: Abrasions on starboard side plating shell (bow-side)			
C	Vessel B: Crushed bow, bent awning supports, damage to awning			
Weather and Sea	Weather: Weather -Fine, Wind direction - southeast, Wind			
Conditions	force 2			
	Sea conditions: Sea surface - calm, Current - east-southeast current			
	of about3 to 4 knots (kn)			
	Sunrise: Around 05:32			
Events Leading to the	Vessel A, with Master A, Navigation Officer A, and 19 other crew			
Accident	members (four nationals of India, three nationals of the People's			
	Republic of Bangladesh, one national of Ukraine, and eleven			
	nationals of the Republic of the Philippines) aboard, was navigating			
	from Pyeongtaek Port, Republic of South Korea, to Higashiharima			
	Port, Hyogo Prefecture, via Osaka Bay.			
	At around 03:25 on September 2, 2019, Pilot A boarded Vessel A			
	near the East Light Buoy of Akashi Kaikyo Traffic Route			
	(hereinafter, when a light buoy starts with "Akashi-Kaikyo Traffic			
	Route," this portion shall be omitted) and exchange information on			
	piloting operations with Master A using a pilot card, etc.			
	Vessel A proceeded toward Akashi-Kaikyo Traffic Route			
	(hereinafter referred to as "the Traffic Route") with navigation lights			
	on and under Pilot A's pilotage, with Master A conning the vessel			
	and stationing Navigation Officer A to monitor the radar and also			
	stationing a able seaman and apprentice navigation officer.			
	At around 03:33, Pilot A notified Osaka Wan Vessel Traffic Service			
	Center (hereinafter referred to as "Osaka MARTIS") of Vessel A's			
	schedule time to enter the Traffic Route by VHF radio telephone			
	(hereinafter referred to as "VHF").			
	At around 04:05, Vessel A passed No. 3 Buoy and entered the			
	Traffic Route and proceeded northwest along the Traffic Route at a			
	speed of approximately 10 kn (speed over the ground; hereinafter			
	the same).			
	Pilot A was giving course instructions with the intention of			
	maintaining a certain distance from No. 2 Buoy as Vessel A			
	approached a bend in the Traffic Route when, at around 04:21, there			
	was a call to Vessel A by VHF from Osaka MARTIS and Pilot A			
	received a communication to watch for a vessel approaching from the			
	direction of Akashi.			
	Master A and Navigation Officer A did not understand the content			
	of the call because the conversation by VHF was in Japanese.			
	Pilot A observed the navigation lights of Vessel B, which was			
	approaching from the starboard side, for the first time and flashed a			
	daylight signal that he had ready at Vessel B several times but then			
	lost sight of Vessel B, and Vessel A collided with Vessel B at around			
	04:22.			

Pilot A notified Osaka MARTIS of the accident and reported that
Vessel B was moving away from Vessel A's starboard stern. At around 04:05, Vessel B, with Master B being the only crew member aboard, departed her moorage at Akashi Port, Akashi City, Hyogo Prefecture, with navigation lights on for fishing grounds to the east of Awaji-shima Island for the purpose of conducting pole- and-line fishing of Japanese Spanish mackerel. At around 04:16, Master B passed Akashi Port's breakwater, sat on a chair in the wheelhouse, and performed ship maneuvering by manual steering. Vessel B proceeded southeast at a speed of about10 kn, with Master B thinking that there were no vessels proceeding west from the direction of Akashi-Kaikyo Bridge at the time he set the south pier of Akashi-Kaikyo Bridge as his heading mark. Master B was observing several vessels proceeding east in the Traffic Route and was considering which of the vessels to pass by their sterns when crossing the route. Vessel B entered the Traffic Route from the north side of the route at around 04:21 and, as Master B was observing the movements of vessels proceeding east, she collided with Vessel A at around 04:22. Master B's forehead, etc., struck a clear view screen in the collision, and after he returned to Akashi Port under his own power without knowing what he had collided with, he was diagnosed at a hospital as having a forehead bruise, lacerations, and chest fracture. (See Attached Figure 1 "Outline Map of the Course of the Accident Events")
 (1) Circumstances of visual sighting, etc., from Vessel A's wheelhouse According to the reply to the questionnaire by Master A, the wheelhouse is approximately 30 m above the ocean's surface, and the visible area from the wheelhouse was the ocean's surface beyond approximately 125 m directly abeam and forward at horizontal distance. According to Vessel A's general arrangement plan, the navigation lights were at a height of approximately 27 m or higher from the ocean's surface. (Attached Figure 2) (2) Circumstances, etc., of Vessel B's navigation lights (a) An awning was installed from the bow to the stern, and a masthead light and a bi-colored light were installed above the awning and below the awning, respectively. (b) The angles from the bi-colored light to the awning at the bow's end and both sides were approximately 10° upward in the direction of the bow and approximately 20° upward directly

	abeam.			
(6		ored light and the wheelf	ouse were adjacent	
	(d) The condition of the light of the bi-colored light was such that			
	light would reach a target at a height of approximately 30 m			
	above the ocean's surface when the target was at a horizontal			
		om Vessel B of approxim		
		f the bow and approxima	itely 75 m or more di	rectly
	abeam.			
	ttached Fig			
(3) C		es of the approach of Vess		
	According	to the images provided by	y Osaka MARTIS and	∃ 3 M·
ra	ange radar i	mages recorded by Vessel	A's VDR, the situatio	on was
a	s follows.			
	• Vessel B	proceeded southeast from	n Akashi Port and er	nterec
	the route	e and, after approaching	to approximately 200) m a
	330° (tru	ue bearing; hereinafter	the same) from Vess	sel A
	proceede	ed south-southwest until j	just prior to the collis	sion.
	• From bet	tween around 04:16 and 0	4:22, passage in the T	Fraffie
	Route w	as displayed as being o	ne vessel proceeding	g wes
	(Vessel A) and four vessels procee	ding east.	
(A	ttached Fig	ure 4 and Attached Figur	e 5)	
(4) N	Ianeuverabi	ility characteristics of Ves	ssel A	
	When in b	ballast, Vessel A's advar	nce,*1 transfer,*2 sh	ortes
si	topping dist	tance, and required time	e for each when mak	ting a
\mathbf{S}^{1}	tarboard tu	rn and port turn with a	rudder angle of 35° a	are as
s	hown in the	following table (see Tabl	e 1).	
	Table 1	Maneuverability charac	teristics of Vessel A	
	Starboard	Advance 660 m	1 min 40 sec	
	turn	Transfer 370 m		
		Advance 650 m	1 min 30 sec	
	Port turn	Transfer 360 m		
	Shortest sto	pping distance 2,250 m	7 min 30 sec	
(5)		be observed based on (ement
	egulations		Sompany 115 manage	
	When a pilot comes aboard, the master, the officer of the watch,			
	_			
a	iookout, an	d a helmsman shall be st	anoneu in the wheelf	Touse

^{*1 &}quot;Advance" refers to the distance advanced by a vessel's center of gravity in the direction of the original course when the vessel turns by 90° from the position of its center of gravity at the time of steering.

^{*2 &}quot;Transfer" refers to the sideways distance a vessel's center of gravity moves from the original course when the vessel turns by 90° from the position of its center of gravity at the time of steering.

and the master shall have the pilot engage in pilotage as the overall person in charge.

According to the masters' instructions, matters to be observed were as follows.

- The officer of the watch has responsibility for the vessel's safe navigation and must continue lookout.
- The officer of the watch is not exempt from lookout duty even when the master or pilot is on the bridge.
- The officer of the watch must report necessary information to the pilot and continue the vessel's safe navigation.

(6) Matters to be confirmed concerning piloting operations

According to the checklist Pilot A presented to Master A, matters to be confirmed with the master concerning piloting operations were as follows.

• Conduct lookout and monitor the movements of other vessels.

• Check the vessel's position and report to the pilot at appropriate times.

(7) Circumstances of lookout of Vessel A and Vessel B

Although, when the accident occurred, it was a time of day when fishing vessels leave Akashi Port, Pilot A did not make any specific requests for lookout giving attention to the situation outside of the Traffic Route, etc., to Master A.

Pilot A had experienced encountering fishing boats that approached vessels navigating in the Traffic Route as they were crossing the route, and he thought that, even if fishing vessels approached, they would navigate by giving way.

After he began pilotage, Pilot A thought that reporting on surrounding conditions by Vessel A's crew was being done appropriately.

When he felt uncertain about the avoiding actions of fishing vessels in the Traffic Route, Pilot A intended to first issue light signals and, if still there was no distinct change in movement, issue whistle signals.

During Pilot A's pilotage, Master A checked whether the able seaman was steering in accordance with Pilot A's course instructions and issued instructions to the apprentice navigation officer.

Navigation Officer A was watching the radar images and keeping lookout of the surroundings while also checking the

had missed Vessel B. After Pilot A communicated by VHF and then hurried to the starboard side and used the daylight signal, Master A and Navigation Officer headed to the starboard wing to follow but heard a load sound at the starboard bow before they could exit the wheelhouse. Vessel B was not equipped with VHF or radar. (See Attached Figure 2 "Vessel A," Attached Figure 3 "Vessel B," Attached Figure 4 "Radar Images, etc., from Vessel A's VDR," Attached Figure 5 "Situation from the Time Pilot A Noticed Vessel B until the Collision," Attached Table 1 "AIS Record of Vessel A (Excorpt)," Attached Table 3 "Information on Voice Communication, etc., Recorded by Vessel A's VDR (Excerpt)," and Attached Table 3 "Table of Events Leading to the Accident") Analysis A: Applicable Involvement of vessel, engine, etc. B: Not Applicable, B: Not Applicable and sea conditions Analysis of the findings Analysis of the findings (1) Circumstances of visual sighting of Vessel A and Vessel B Vessel B's image was displayed at a distance of approximately 3,500 m directly shead at 0416:54, and therefore it is highly probable that Vessel A's navigation light serve visible from Vessel B's bicolored light's reach and visibility from Vessel B's wheelhouse and Vessel B's bicolored light was visible from Vessel B's wheelhouse and Vessel B bicolored light was visible from Vessel A's wheelhouse at the picolored light was visible from Vessel A's wheelhouse at the picolored light was visible from Vessel A's wheelhouse at the picolored light was visible from Vessel A's wheelhouse at the picolored light was visible from Vessel A's wheelhouse as the person coming the vessel, Vessel A was proceed

Vessel B.

It is probable that, when Pilot A noticed Vessel B, Vessel A could not evade Vessel B, which had approached to approximately 200 m, by her own action alone.

It is probable that Vessel B was proceeding southeast at a speed of approximately 10 kn after leaving Akashi Port, with Master B alone aboard.

It is probable that, because Vessel B was proceeding southsouthwest after entering the Traffic Route and collided with Vessel A, Master B turned the rudder to starboard with the intention of passing the sterns of vessels that were proceeding east.

It is highly probable that Vessel A and Vessel B did not possess means of mutual communication, such as VHF, etc.

(3) Circumstances of lookout of Vessel A and Vessel B

It is probable that, although he knew that, at the time of the accident, it was a time of day when fishing vessels leave port, Pilot A continued to navigate by directing his attention to maintaining Vessel A's path within the Traffic Route and did not make any specific requests for lookout giving attention to the situation outside of the Traffic Route to Master A because he thought that fishing vessels would navigate by giving way to Vessel A and he had not received a report of Vessel B's approach.

It is probable that Pilot A used the daylight signal to alert the approaching fishing boat just prior to the accident but was unable to arouse Master B's attention.

It is probable that Master A and Navigation Officer A did not notice Vessel B's approach until Pilot A used the daylight signal and did not report Vessel B's approach to Pilot A.

It is probable that Master A was giving instructions to crew members but his instructions to Navigation Officer A to provide lookout of the situation outside of the Traffic Route were incomplete.

It is probable that Master B was not sufficiently checking the Traffic Route's situation after setting the south pier of Akashi-Kaikyo Bridge as hisheading mark.

It is somewhat likely that, at the time of the accident, there were several vessels proceeding eastbound Vessel B's west and Master B was directing his attention to the vessels proceeding east and did not notice Vessel A proceeding west because he was considering which of the vessels to pass by their sterns.

It is probable that, after entering the Traffic Route from the north, Master B continued crossing the route with his attention directed at the vessels proceeding east.

It is highly probable that Master B was required to give way to

	Vessel A's path after entering the Traffic Route.
Probable Causes	It is probable that the accident occurred when, as Vessel A was
	proceeding west under Pilot A's pilotage and Vessel B was proceeding
	southeast in the Traffic Route at night, both vessels collided because
	Pilot A continued navigating with his attention directed to
	maintaining Vessel A's path within the Traffic Route and Vessel B
	continued proceeding south-southwest and crossing the Traffic
	Route after entering the route with his attention on vessels that
	were proceeding east in the Traffic Route.
	It is somewhat likely that Master B proceeded south-southwest
	and continued crossing the Traffic Route after entering the route for
	the reason that, at the time of the accident, there were several
	vessels proceeding east to Vessel B's west and Master B was
	directing his attention to the vessels proceeding east and did not
	notice Vessel A proceeding west because he was considering which of
	the vessels to pass by their sterns.
	It is probable that Pilot A continued navigating with his attention
	directed to maintaining Vessel B's path within the route because he
	did not personally notice Vessel A's approach and there was no report
	of Vessel B's approach from Master A or Navigation Officer A.
	It is probable that the situation whereby Pilot A did not make any
	specific requests for lookout giving attention to the situation outside
	of the Traffic Route to Master A despite knowing that, at the time of
	the accident, it was a time of day when fishing vessels leave port
	contributed to the accident's occurrence.
Safety Actions	It is probable that the following actions will be useful in
	preventing the reoccurrence of a similar accident.
	• Vessels crossing a traffic route enter the route after fully
	ascertaining the passage of other vessels navigating in the route
	prior to entry.
	• Vessels entering a traffic route from outside the route give way
	to vessels navigating along the route.
	• Vessels navigating in a traffic route conduct lookout for vessels
	outside the route due to the possibility that fishing vessels, etc.,
	may cross the route, and conduct lookout for fishing vessels, etc.,
	present near the traffic route particularly when altering course.
	• Vessels navigating in a traffic route, and particularly large
	vessels, issue warning signals consisting of at least five short
	blasts to fishing vessels, etc., approaching from outside the
	route so that the masters of those vessels quickly and certainly

notice the navigating vessel's presence, giving consideration to
the possibility that blind spots from the wheelhouse exist and
that means for communicating with fishing vessels, etc., are
unavailable.
• Pilots make specific requests for lookout in accordance with the
local situation to masters, giving consideration to the season,
time of day, topography, current, conditions of vessel passage,
operating conditions of fishing vessels, conditions of maritime
construction work, etc.
· Pilots proactively apply BRM to ensure communication and
sharing of information with masters and crew members.

Attached Figure 1 Outline Map of the Course of the Accident Events















Time (HH:MM:SS)	Ship's J Latitude (N) (°'')	Dosition* Longitude (E) (°-'-")	Course Over the Ground* (°)	Heading* (°)	Speed Over the Ground (knots [kn])
03:44:00	34-35-13.8	135-06-24.5	272.6	274	9.4
03:50:01	34-35-17.7	135-05-19.3	288.7	289	8.1
04:00:00	34-35-54.8	135-03-48.8	301.7	299	9.3
04:05:00	34-36-18.8	135-03-01.0	298.1	299	9.2
04:14:00	34-37-04.0	$135 \cdot 01 \cdot 35.3$	308.1	305	9.5
04:15:00	34-37-09.9	135-01-26.1	308.5	305	9.8
04:16:00	34-37-16.3	135-01-16.6	306.8	303	9.9
04:17:00	34-37-21.7	135-01-06.5	303.2	300	10.0
04:18:00	34-37-27.1	135-00-56.0	300.2	297	10.2
04:19:00	$34 \cdot 37 \cdot 31.2$	135-00-44.8	289.9	286	10.2
04:20:01	34-37-33.6	135-00-32.7	278.7	275	10.0
04:21:01	34-37-34.1	135-00-20.6	271.4	270	10.2
04:22:01	34-37-34.3	135-00-08.0	271.7	270	10.5
04:23:02	34-37-34.6	134-59-55.0	272.4	270	10.9

Attached Table 1 AIS Record of Vessel A (Excerpt)

*: The vessel position indicates the position of the GPS antenna installed above the bridge, and the courses over the ground and headings indicated in true bearings.

Attached Table 2 Information on Voice Communication, etc., Recorded by Vessel A's VDR (Excerpt)

	Vessel A	Osaka MARTIS
	Pilot A : Osaka MARTIS, Osaka MARTIS, This is GLOVIS COMPANION. Do you read me?	Yes, GLOVIS COMPANION, this is Osaka MARTIS. Proceed with notice. Over.
03:33:38 to 03:35:20	Pilot A : Good morning. We will head to Akashi Kaikyo now. We request entry into the route as scheduled at 04:10. Over.	Roger. Zero-four-one-zero, understood. Here is current information on the situation in the traffic route. There is no conspicuous fishing vessel activity up to the traffic route in your direction and inside the traffic route at the present time. Current is east-going at 4.8 knots and subsiding. Over.
	Pilot A : Roger. Good-bye.	Thank you for your notice. Good-bye.
04:20:45 to	Pilot A : This is GLOVIS COMPANION. Did you call? Over.	GLOVIS COMPANION, GLOVIS COMPANION, this is Osaka MARTIS. Yes. There is currently one vessel approaching
04:21:41	Pilot A : Roger. Thank you. We will proceed with caution. Thank you very much.	your vessel's forward starboard side from the direction of Akashi. Use caution. Over.

04:21:50	Sound: Click, click, click, click	Very good. Returning to Channel 16. Good-bye.
04:22:05	Sound: Bang	
04:22:51 to 04:24:08	 Pilot A : Osaka MARTIS, Osaka MARTIS, this is GLOVIS COMPANION. It appears we struck the fishing vessel. Over. Pilot A : She is drifting away from us, but does not appear to be sinking or experiencing particular difficulty. Pilot A : Roger. 	This is Osaka MARTIS. Understood. What is the fishing vessel's current condition? Over. Roger. Understand that the fishing boat has not sunk. Stand by on Channel 16. Over.

Attached Table 3	Table of Events	Leading to the Accident
------------------	-----------------	-------------------------

	Vessel A	Pilot A or	Vessel B	Master B
	VE556171	Vessel A crew member	Vessel D	Master D
Around 03:25	Pilot A comes aboard at a position east of the East Light Buoy.	Pilot A and Master A exchange information on piloting operations using a pilot card, etc. Pilot A notifies Osaka MARTIS of the scheduled entry time into the traffic route.		
Around 04:05	Passes No. 3 Buoy.		Departs moorage at Akashi Port.	
Around 04:15	Passes Akashi- Kaikyo Bridge.			
Around 04:16	Vessel B appears on radar at approx. 1.8 M (3,500 m).		Passes Akashi Port's breakwater.	Navigates with the Akashi-Kaikyo Bridge's southern pier as a target.
	Proceeding NW		Proceeding SE	
Around 04:18	Begins to alter course along traffic route.			
Around 04:21	Receives VHF call from Osaka MARTIS to alert that Vessel B is approaching. Proceeding W	After the call, Pilot A notices Vessel B, which had approached to approximately 200 m. Pilot A shines the daylight signal.	Enters the Traffic Route. Proceeding SSW	Does not notice Vessel A. Observes the movements of vessels proceeding east in the route from the west and considers which vessels to pass by their sterns.
Around 04:22	Collision	Pilot A and Vessel A crew members hear the sound of a collision.	Collision	Does not know what he hit.

Around	Pilot A notifies Osaka	
04:23	MARTIS that an accident	t
	has occurred.	